

OPINION 129

Bipinnaria 1835 vs. *Luidia* 1839

SUMMARY.—The rules are herewith suspended in the case of *Bipinnaria* 1835 vs. *Luidia* 1839, on the ground that "the strict application of the Règles will clearly result in greater confusion than uniformity." *Luidia* Forbes, 1839, with monotype *fragilissima* 1839 (subjective synonym of *Luidia ciliaris* 1837), is hereby placed in the Official List of Generic Names. The names *Auricularia*, *Bipinnaria*, *Brachiolaria*, and *Pluteus* are hereby excluded from availability as generic names and are reserved as designations of developmental stages.

STATEMENT OF CASE.—Mortensen submits his argument in "Annals and Magazine of Natural History", vol. 10, pp. 350-351, Oct. 1932, and his presentation is herewith made a part of this Opinion.

DISCUSSION.—Article 37*b*, quoted by Dr. Mortensen, has an interesting history.

The original draft of the International Rules provided an exception to the Law of Priority for certain animals undergoing metamorphoses and change of host, and this exception was included in the rules as adopted by the Moscow Congress in 1892. This same provision was retained in the draft prepared for the Cambridge Congress in 1897. In the 1901 Meeting in Berlin, Commissioners Blanchard and Stiles argued for the retention of this exception, but were overwhelmingly defeated in the final vote and they conceded the point for the sake of harmony.

The parasitic worms, particularly Trematoda and Cestoda, were the first groups to accommodate themselves to the Berlin decision in so far as generic names are concerned; although many specific names are involved, fortunately few generic names come into consideration.

The case of *Bipinnaria* vs. *Luidia* is the first one to come before the Commission for Opinion. The essential data, as made out by the Secretary on basis of Mortensen, 1932, and Sherborn's *Index* are as follows:

Bipinnaria Sars, 1835, Beskr. Bergenske, Kyst Dry, p. 37 monotype *asterigera* Sars, 1835, *ibid.*, p. 37.

Luidia Forbes, 1839, Mem. Wernerian Soc., no. 8, p. 123, monotype *fragilissima* Forbes, 1839, *idem*, p. 123.

Bipinnaria asterigera has been identified as the larval stage of, and therefore a subjective synonym of, *Luidia sarsi*.

Luidia fragilissima has been identified as a subjective synonym of *Luidia ciliaris* (Philippi, 1837, [*Asterias*]) Gray, 1840. p. 183.

Accordingly, *Luidia* 1839 becomes a subjective synonym of *Bipinnaria* 1835 and the name of the larval stage becomes the name of the genus. Further,

Luidia sarsi is an adult stage. Furthermore, *Bipinnaria asterigera* 1835, the name of a larval stage, becomes the name of the species now known as *Luidia sarsi*, since the latter is a subjective synonym of the former.

The effect is that a larval form (*asterigera*), in which various organs important for classification are not yet developed, becomes the type of a genus, in connection with which it is essential to know these undeveloped organs in order to determine the genus and to classify the species, and we have not even the benefit in this case of objective synonyms but only subjective synonyms. Accordingly, the case is much stronger than one would first assume from Dr. Mortensen's presentation.

Furthermore also, in the echinoderms are recognized various larval stages, *Auricularia*, *Bipinnaria*, *Brachiolaria*, *Pluteus*, the names of which have become current in general zoology and embryology. To grant to these names the availability as generic names is to assume the risk of confusion (to an extent which cannot possibly be foreseen) in the nomenclature of the echinoderms in systematic zoology and in geology as influenced by paleontology. Here again the case is much stronger than one might assume from a casual study of Dr. Mortensen's presentation.

The Secretary recommends that the Commission adopt as its Opinion the Summary given above.

Opinion prepared by Stiles.

Opinion concurred in by thirteen (13) Commissioners: Apstein, Bather, Chapman, Fantham, Horvath, Ishikawa, Peters, K. Jordan, Richter, Silvestri, Stejneger, Stiles, Stone.

Opinion dissented from by no Commissioner.

Not voting, five (5) Commissioners: Bolivar, Cabrera, Handlirsch, Pellegrin, Stephenson.